

LAW JOURNAL
FOR SOCIAL JUSTICE
SANDRA DAY O’CONNOR COLLEGE OF LAW
ARIZONA STATE UNIVERSITY

Volume 4 **Fall** **2013**

CONTENTS

Testing the Death Penalty <i>Paul Charlton, Quintin Cushner, and William H. Knight</i>	1
Hyde-ing From the Truth: Does the Hyde Amendment Provide an Adequate Remedy for Known Prosecutorial Misconduct? <i>William H. Knight</i>	13
Provocation Excuse: Using International Laws and Norms to Give Perspective in the Domestic Sphere..... <i>Erin Iungerich</i>	33
“Lockdown for Liberty!” Black Masculinity, Mass Incarceration, Labor and the Georgia Prisoners Strike <i>Jeremiah Chin</i>	54
LGBTQ Intimate Partner Violence in Phoenix..... <i>Justin Hoffman</i>	77



Law Journal for Social Justice is supported by the Sandra Day O'Connor College of Law at Arizona State University. The *Law Journal for Social Justice* mailing address is: Law Journal for Social Justice, P.O. Box 877906, 1100 S. McAllister Ave., Tempe, AZ 85287. The *Law Journal for Social Justice* email address is: lawjournalforsocialjustice@gmail.com.

Subscription: *Law Journal for Social Justice* is an online journal. Editions are accessible through the URL: <http://www.law.asu.edu/ljsj/>, and <http://www.ljsj.wordpress.com/journal>

Copyright: © Copyright 2013 by Law Journal for Social Justice. All rights reserved except as otherwise provided.
Cite as 4 L.J. Soc. Justice __ (2013).

LGBTQ INTIMATE PARTNER VIOLENCE IN PHOENIX

By Justin Hoffman *

Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender, and Questioning (LGBTQ) intimate partner violence is a pervasive issue throughout the United States. A recent Center for Disease Control and Prevention survey found that individuals in LGBTQ relationships are more likely to face intimate partner violence. Currently, the city of Phoenix and surrounding areas have an inadequate system for specifically dealing with LGBTQ domestic violence. To fix the issues affecting Phoenix, a full audit of the LGBTQ domestic violence resources needs to be conducted, along with a streamlining of resources to achieve a system where survivors do not have to go from agency to agency to find resources and can locate all of the information they need in one area. Additional improvements and suggestions like a Family Resource Center for domestic violence survivors and specific LGBTQ safety plans also offer additional safeguards to allow for the maximum level of help that an LGBTQ domestic violence survivor could utilize.

Introduction

In order to solve the LGBTQ intimate partner violence problem in Phoenix, the city needs to conduct an audit of all the services currently offered, and streamline those into one accessible place that any LGBTQ intimate partner victim can access. Additionally, the city of Phoenix needs to look to other cities and community agencies to learn from organizations who are addressing the LGBTQ intimate partner violence in a more encompassing, complete manner.

According to the US National Census in 2010, Phoenix has approximately 1.5 million people in the city alone.¹ This does not account for the many other towns and cities that surround Phoenix to make up the metropolitan area known as the “Valley of the Sun”, which encompasses a

* Justin M. Hoffman, J.D. Candidate, 2014, Sandra Day O’Connor College of Law, Arizona State University. In the interest of full disclosure, Justin Hoffman is on staff of the Law Journal for Social Justice, but was not involved in the selection of this article for publication.

¹ *State and County Quick Facts*, United States Census (Apr. 28, 2013, 9:15PM), <http://quickfacts.census.gov/qfd/states/04/045000.html>.

little over 4 million people.² Despite Phoenix's growth, resources for LGBTQ³ intimate partner victims have not kept up with that growth. After conducting research to determine what resources are available to LGBTQ domestic violence victims it appears that there are limited resources in the city, and the resources that are available are not streamlined. In order to identify LGBTQ domestic violence resources, a domestic violence victim has to contact multiple agencies and conduct hours of research online. While my original project was to focus on youth LGBTQ domestic violence in the city of Phoenix, I realized that my scope was much too small.⁴ Instead, I decided to focus on the Phoenix Metropolitan Area and identify resources that were available to all LGBTQ domestic violence victims regardless of age and qualifiers. Given the increased risk of intimate partner violence in LGBTQ relationships and the large number of LGBTQ couples living in Arizona and Phoenix in particular, a comprehensive list of LGBTQ domestic violence resources and safety plans should be compiled to ensure that all residents have adequate access to services when they need them.⁵

I. LGBTQ Intimate Partner Violence Occurs at an Equal or Higher Rate as Heterosexual Intimate Partner Violence

The National Intimate Partner and Sexual Violence Survey, released in January 2013, was the first comprehensive survey about LGBTQ Intimate Partner Violence available from a national perspective.⁶ The survey was conducted over a ten-month period, and included over 18,000 interviews (9,970 women and 8,079 men).⁷ The results of the survey indicated that overall, individuals that identified gay, lesbian, or bisexual reported levels of intimate partner violence equal to or higher than those of heterosexuals.⁸ The lifetime prevalence of rape, physical violence, and/or stalking by an intimate partner for women was: Lesbian – 43.8%, Bisexual – 61.1%, and Heterosexual – 35.0%.⁹ For men, the lifetime

² *State and County Quick Facts*, United States Census (Apr. 28, 2013, 9:20PM), <http://quickfacts.census.gov/qfd/states/04/04013.html>.

³ LGBTQ refers to the Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender and Queer population.

⁴ No agencies were able to identify resources specifically for LGBTQ youth domestic violence victims.

⁵ Center for Disease Control and Prevention: *The National Intimate Partner and Sexual Violence Survey* (2013).

⁶ *Id.* at 1.

⁷ *Id.*

⁸ *Id.*

⁹ *Id.*

prevalence of rape, physical violence, and/or stalking by an intimate partner was: Gay – 26%, Bisexual – 37.3%, and Heterosexual – 29.0%.¹⁰

Data from seven states and six cities that participated in Centers for Disease Control and Prevention’s Youth Risk Behavior Surveillance System from 2001-2009 indicated a higher prevalence of dating violence and unwanted forced sexual intercourse among lesbian, gay, and bisexual youth than heterosexual youth.¹¹ Additionally, only one in five LGBTQ victims of intimate partner violence or sexual assault solicit and receive help from service providers.¹² These statistics show that LGBTQ intimate partner violence is occurring on a regular basis and that most LGBTQ community members who face such issues do not come forward to get the help and resources they need.

II. LGBTQ Relationships and Legal Protections in Arizona

Last month, the Phoenix City Council approved an LGBTQ anti-discrimination law which “expand[s] the city’s anti-discrimination law to include protections for gays, lesbians, bisexuals and transgender people in city contracts, housing, places of employment, and public accommodations such as restaurants.”¹³ While this law may be marginally beneficial for LGBTQ domestic violence victims, many victims need services far beyond the basic laws that are provided in 166 other United States cities and counties.¹⁴ Additionally, with so many reported same-sex couples in the Phoenix Metropolitan Area, along with the many couples which are probably not captured by the US Census statistics, it is clear that Phoenix needs resources for these couples when domestic violence situations arise between them. One recent Gallup poll from February 15, 2013 found that 3.9% of Arizona resident respondents identified as lesbian, gay, bisexual or transgendered.¹⁵ Based on this percentage and the 2012 US Census Bureau estimate of Arizona’s population at 6,553,255, I

¹⁰ *Id.*

¹¹ *Id.*

¹² NATIONAL CENTER FOR VICTIMS OF CRIME AND NATIONAL COALITION OF ANTI-VIOLENCE PROGRAMS: WHY IT MATTERS: RETHINKING VICTIM ASSISTANCE FOR LESBIAN, GAY, BISEXUAL, TRANSGENDER, AND QUEER VICTIMS OF HATE VIOLENCE AND INTIMATE PARTNER VIOLENCE (2010).

¹³ *Phoenix approves LGBT-inclusive anti-discrimination law*, LGBTQ NATION (Mar. 30, 2013, 9:30 AM), <http://www.lgbtqnation.com/2013/02/breaking-phoenix-approves-lgbt-inclusive-anti-discrimination-law/>.

¹⁴ *Id.*

¹⁵ Gary J. Gates and Frank Newport, *LGBT Percentage Highest in D.C., Lowest in North Dakota*, GALLUP (Apr. 1, 2013, 5:05PM), <http://www.gallup.com/poll/lgbt-percentage-highest-lowest-north-dakota.aspx>.

estimate that over 250,000 people in the state of Arizona identify as lesbian, gay, bisexual or transgender.¹⁶

According to the 2010 United States Census, there are currently 15,817 same-sex couples living in the state of Arizona. Out of those 15,817 same-sex couples, 8,296 (52%) of the couples were female same-sex couples, and 7,521 (48%) of the couples were same-sex male couples.¹⁷ Out of the total number of same-sex couples, 2,608 (16%) of the couples were raising their own children.¹⁸ Additionally, in Maricopa County there are 10,147 same-sex couples or 7.19 same-sex couples per 1,000 households; this makes Maricopa County the 113th highest county for same-sex couples in the nation who have more than fifty same-sex couples in their county.¹⁹ Additionally, Arizona has the thirteenth highest proportion of same-sex couples per 1,000 households out of all fifty states and the District of Columbia, and Phoenix ranks twentieth in the nation for the number of same-sex households per 1,000 households right behind more LGBTQ friendly cities like St. Paul, Minnesota and Chicago, Illinois.²⁰

III. The Costs to Society of LGBTQ Intimate Partner Violence

Being proactive about domestic violence in general can save the state many resources in the long run. The cost of prosecuting a homicide and incarcerating a domestic violence offender is approximately \$2,550,000.²¹ This figure represents the costs of four police responses, two temporary restraining orders, a 180-day jail term, two years' probation, one emergency room visit, two weeks in a domestic violence shelter, one week at a center for three children, one year of foster care for three children, two coroners' autopsies, a homicide investigation, a prosecution and a state prison sentence.²² Not surprisingly, the two most expensive items in domestic violence homicides are the homicide investigation and prosecution at \$1,500,000, and the state prison sentence at \$1,000,000.²³ Additionally, The National Institute of Justice estimates the average cost of a domestic violence homicide at \$2,400,000.²⁴

¹⁶ Based on taking the average 3.9% of LGBTQ residents, multiplied by the overall population rate.

¹⁷ *Id.* at 2.

¹⁸ *Id.* at 3.

¹⁹ *Id.* at 4.

²⁰ The Williams Institute: United States Census Snapshot: 2010 (2010).

²¹ CASEY GWINN & GAEL STRACK, DREAM BIG 101-102 (Wheatmark 2010).

²² *Id.*

²³ *Id.*

²⁴ *Id.*

Casey Gwinn in San Diego has cut the cost of adjudicating domestic violence crimes in San Diego by creating “family justice centers” in the city.²⁵ Family justice centers consolidate resources for domestic violence victims in to one accessible location, avoiding the need for victims to visit upwards of thirty separate locations for services.²⁶ The obvious benefit of the program is the one-stop location of services as well as collaboration between the various agencies in order to promote innovative solutions to domestic violence issues.²⁷ The other benefit is the amount of money the county of San Diego is saving!

Other cities have experienced similar results as San Diego by instituting family justice centers. The Mayor of New York City, Michael Bloomberg has lead the city to institute family justice centers throughout the community.²⁸ New York City has built three family justice centers since 2005, and has worked with over 200 community organizations to create these new centers.²⁹ Violence in the city has decreased due to these efforts with family violence related crimes declining by twenty-one percent and intimate partner homicides declining by fifty-one percent citywide.³⁰

The introduction of family justice center(s) to Alameda County, California, caused similar positive effects. Domestic violence homicides declined from thirty in 2001 to seven in 2007.³¹ When the family justice center first opened, fifty-five percent of misdemeanors were not prosecuted because the victim refused to participate.³² After three years, the victim-refusal rate decreased to nineteen percent.³³ Felony domestic violence cases followed the same pattern within the community. In 2006, thirty-one percent of felony domestic violence cases were not charged because the victim refused to participate; within three years that number decreased to approximately nineteen percent.³⁴

While the family justice center statistics relate specifically to heterosexual intimate partner violence, it does have credence for LGBTQ intimate partner violence. For example, in Washington, DC, 75-80% of cases handled by the Gay and Lesbian Liaison Unit of the District of

²⁵ *Id.*

²⁶ *Id.* at 66-68.

²⁷ *Id.* at 67-68.

²⁸ *Id.* at 138.

²⁹ *Id.* at 138.

³⁰ *Id.* at 138.

³¹ *Id.* at 139.

³² *Id.* at 139.

³³ *Id.* at 139.

³⁴ *Id.* at 139.

Columbia Metropolitan Police Department are domestic violence related.³⁵ If some of the violence could be preempted this could make the Phoenix area a much safer place for LGBTQ people to live, as well as save Maricopa County a significant amount of money each year.

IV. How are LGBTQ Intimate Partner Concerns different from heterosexual intimate partner concerns?

LGBTQ victims of intimate partner violence can have additional concerns that some heterosexual LGBTQ intimate partner victims may not have. For example, LGBTQ youth may have to come out³⁶ to their parents in order to receive support for finding help in their domestic violence relationships. Coming out to parents can include detrimental effects. One study found that LGBTQ youth ages fourteen to twenty-one who came out to their parents disclosed more verbal and physical abuse by family members and experienced more suicidality, than their peers who chose to not disclose their sexual orientation to their family.³⁷ Additionally, some parents may not support their children financially or choose to provide clothing, food, or housing when they find out their children are LGBTQ.³⁸ Most of these issues relate to younger LGBTQ domestic violence victims. However, many LGBTQ members are still not accepted and loved by their families regardless of their age. In essence, regardless of their age, LGBTQ domestic violence victims may not receive any sort of encouragement or support from family members. Another concern for LGBTQ domestic violence members can be ‘coming out’ to the community and/or nonprofit organizations in order to receive support for their abusive intimate partner relationships.

Within the community at large, there is still a stigma that is associated with being part of the LGBTQ community. Individuals may have pre-conceived notions, make rude comments, or even resort to violence.³⁹ These concerns are ever-present as members of the LGBTQ community

³⁵ *Get The Facts*, SHOW ME LOVE, INC. (Mar. 25, 2013 6:30PM), <http://showmelovedc.org/lang/en-us/get-the-facts/>.

³⁶ To recognize one's sexual orientation, gender identity, or sex identity, and to be open about it with oneself and with others. *Definition of Terms*, UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA-BERKELEY GENDER EQUITY RESOURCE CENTER (Apr. 1, 2013 5:35PM), http://geneq.berkeley.edu/lgbt_resources_definition_of_terms#coming_out.

³⁷ Anthony R. D'Augelli, Scott L. Hershberger & Neil W. Pilkington, *Lesbian, Gay, and Bisexual Youth and Their Families: Disclosure of Sexual Orientation and Its Consequences*. 68 AM. J. ORTHOPSYCHIATRY 361 (1998).

³⁸ Gill Valentine, Tracey Skelton & Ruth Butler, *Coming out and outcomes: negotiating lesbian and gay identities with, and in, the family*, 21 ENV & PLAN. D: SOC. & SPACE 479 (2003).

³⁹ *Id.*

ask for help in intimate partner violence situations. In order to actually ask for help, LGBTQ domestic violence victims must often disclose their sexual orientation, which can be a fear-inducing process. This is just one more added stress-factor when LGBTQ domestic violence victims are considering looking for help.

Another concern for LGBTQ intimate partner victims is where to go when they decide to leave their intimate partner. Many shelters are for females and children only, and have policies that forbid men from accessing the Domestic Violence Shelter in order to keep them as safe as possible. Accordingly, while lesbians may have an easier time trying to find shelter, gay males can have a difficult time finding a shelter in their area. A majority of the domestic violence victims are women⁴⁰, however, there are foreseeable situations where a male LGBTQ victim may need shelter.⁴¹

V. Personal Experience Finding LGBTQ Intimate Partner Violence Resources

In order to get a sense of what an LGBTQ victim of domestic violence faces when seeking out assistance, I decided to start from the ground zero and research what resources were available in Phoenix. I started my search for resources with the Domestic Violence Hotline, by calling 1-800-799-SAFE.⁴² I explained to the telephone bank volunteer what I was trying to accomplish and asked for the LGBTQ domestic violence resources in Phoenix. Much to my dismay, in a thirty-five mile radius of Phoenix the only resource available was Eve's Place,⁴³ which was located outside of Phoenix in Peoria, AZ on the Northwest side of the city. Along with this one resource, the Domestic Violence Hotline was able to give me some online or national resources including the GLBT

⁴⁰ Shannan M. Catalano, Bureau of Justice Statistics, Office of Justice Programs, U.S. Dep't of Justice, NCJ 239203, *Intimate Partner Violence 1993 – 2010*, 2 (Nov. 27, 2012) at <http://www.bjs.gov/index.cfm?ty=pbdeatil&iid=4536> (“About 4 in 5 victims of intimate partner violence were female from 1994 to 2010”).

⁴¹ Currently in AZ, male victims are supposed to be placed in a hotel if they are victims of domestic violence if they call the Arizona Domestic Violence Coalition.

⁴² The Domestic Violence hotline is accessible by dialing 1-800-799-SAFE (7233) or by using their computer to go to [thehotline.org](http://www.thehotline.org). The website additionally has a warning for users: “Computer use can be monitored and is impossible to completely clear. If you are afraid your internet and/or computer usage might be monitored, please use a safer computer, and/or call the National Domestic Violence Hotline at 1-800-799-SAFE(7233) or TTY 1-800-787-3224.” THE NATIONAL DOMESTIC VIOLENCE HOTLINE (Mar. 25, 2013 6:30PM), <http://www.thehotline.org>.

⁴³ Eve's Place: A Place of Safety in the Northwest Valley. 8101 N 35th Ave # D10, Phoenix, AZ 85051. (602) 995-7450

Help Center,⁴⁴ the National Center for Lesbian Rights,⁴⁵ PFLAG,⁴⁶ and an organization called Show Me Love⁴⁷ located in Washington, DC. I also asked the phone bank volunteer about LGBT services offered in the San Francisco⁴⁸ area, and she told me there were five domestic violence resources. Due to the high concentration of LGBTQ citizens and the progressive nature of the area, I assumed the Domestic Violence Hotline would have more resources for the city.⁴⁹ Additionally, she explained that safety plans⁵⁰ were a collaborative process that the caller phoning in and the phone bank operators would do together based on the specific needs of the person.

Again and again I received similar responses from the community agencies that I contacted. Specifically, the community agencies did not have any resources available from their office, but had a list of resources to redirect people to. While these national resources may be great, they are not located in Phoenix and make an assumption that the individuals have access to the internet, without fear of an intimate partner reviewing their internet activity or taking retribution against them for seeking domestic violence resources.

All of the phone calls, emails, and checking websites was an exhausting process that encompassed many hours.⁵¹ Fortunately, I was not in any danger and did not need services at that time. However, an LGBTQ domestic violence victim may not have the luxury of time or transportation on their side.⁵² A victim may only have time to locate these resources for thirty minutes to an hour per day, under cover at work, at the community library or any number of possible roadblocks to open and free

⁴⁴ GLBT Help Center. 1-888-843-4564. <http://www.glbtnationalhelpcenter.org>

⁴⁵ National Center for Lesbian Rights. <http://www.nclrights.org>.

⁴⁶ Parents, Families and Friends of Lesbians and Gays. <http://www.pflag.org>.

⁴⁷ Show Me Love DC! <http://showmelovedc.org/>

⁴⁸ Specifically San Francisco and the entire Bay Area including Oakland and surrounding communities

⁴⁹ San Francisco has the highest same-sex couples per 1000 households percentage wise out of large cities with 250,000 or more people. The Williams Institute: United States Census Snapshot (2010).

⁵⁰ A safety plan is an action oriented plan in order to help the victim stay alive in the event of threatening attacks from a batterer. A sample safety plan is available from the American Bar Association's Torts and Insurance Practice Section "Domestic Violence, Safety Tips For You and Your Family" at www.abanet.org/tips/publicservice/dvsafety.html. The Youth Safety Plan is available from the American Bar Association's Commission on Domestic Violence website at: www.abanet.org/domviol.

⁵¹ This time includes calling different agencies, a lot of times speaking to one representative and then being transferred to a supervisor or some sort of manager.

⁵² Sarah M. Buel, *Fifty Obstacles to Leaving a.k.a., Why Abuse Victims Stay*, 28 COLO. LAW. 10, 19-28 (1999).

information of resources.⁵³ Once a victim finds resources in the Phoenix Metropolitan Area, they may have trouble accessing these resources. The city of Phoenix was 516 square miles according to the 2010 US Census, while Maricopa County was 9,200 square miles.⁵⁴ This does not include the many other cities and surrounding towns, which make up the metropolitan area. Accessing a bus, finding a friend to drive the victim, or even driving one's own car can be a resource-intensive process.

In one particular conversation that I had with the Director of Victim Services of the Phoenix City Attorney's Office, she had to stop and ask me what LGBT stands for.⁵⁵ While I hope this was because she misheard me, or some other excuse, it does show the need for additional training in the legal field in the Phoenix area. LGBTQ may not be known as standing for Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender and Queer throughout the entire country, but one would hope that members of the legal field would be able to recognize the acronym to save further uncomfortable feelings of the caller about identifying themselves as LGBTQ. Even though my friends, family and colleagues know that I am gay, it was awkward and uncomfortable to have to continually 'come out' to a variety of different phone bank volunteers when seeking their resources. This could be an additional reason why some victims of LGBTQ domestic violence do not seek additional help or services when they are in intimate partner violence situations.

Overall, I found that many resources throughout the Phoenix Metropolitan Area were disjointed and not well organized. The Phoenix Police Department gave me a couple of resources which did not match the National Domestic Hotline, match what the Victim Services Advocate gave me from the city attorney's office. It was clear to me based on trying to find LGBTQ domestic violence resources in Phoenix, that a streamlined list needs to be made of resources and that this list needs to be distributed to all of the agencies that effected respond to LGBTQ domestic violence in order to create a cohesive community response that will be able to provide adequate resources to LGBTQ domestic violence victims and continuing support to the survivors after their intimate partner violence situation has terminated.

⁵³ *Id.*

⁵⁴ *State and County Quick Facts*, United States Census (Apr. 28, 2013, 9:20PM), <http://quickfacts.census.gov/qfd/states/04/04013.html>.

⁵⁵ Telephone Interview with Head of the Victim Advocate for the City of Phoenix Attorney's Office. (March 2013).

VI. Model Programs

A. Northwest Network

The Northwest Network is a nonprofit organization in Seattle, WA that offers services to LGBT Intimate Partner victims by offering a variety of services. The mission statement listed on the website shows the full scope of the resources and services provided by the organization.⁵⁶

When someone goes to the website for the Northwest Network, they are immediately asked why they are visiting the website.⁵⁷ The options listed on the website include: “I am checking out resources for myself,” “I am looking for information for a friend,” “I want to learn about queer issues,” “I want to have better relationships,” “I am a young person looking for support,” and “I work in the field, and am looking for resources.”⁵⁸ After a domestic violence victim chooses an appropriate option for themselves, he or she is redirected to a new webpage which lists the various resources of the Northwest Network including relationship skills classes, safety planning, academic articles relating to Intimate Partner Violence, peer counseling and resources referrals.⁵⁹ In effect, the Northwest Network is combining all of the resources that a Family Justice Center would have and making them available to LGBTQ Domestic Violence victims. The Northwest Network also has other resources that are applicable to the LGBTQ community in Seattle including smoking resources, HIV/AIDS resources, General Wellness Support, Support for Parents and Families, as well as recreational and sports resources for the LGBTQ community.⁶⁰ By expanding the list of resources, the Northwest Network is allowing people to take a proactive, healthy approach to relationships, which may in fact be preventative by decreasing the likelihood of someone potentially being in an LGBTQ Intimate Partner Violence situation. Additionally, by having up-to-date online resources for LGBTQ Intimate Partner Violence victims, the Northwest Network is

⁵⁶ Mission Statement:

The NW Network increases our communities’ ability to support the self-determination and safety of bisexual, transgendered, lesbian and gay survivors of abuse through education, organizing and advocacy.

We work within a broad liberation movement dedicated to social and economic justice, equality and respect for all people and the creation of loving, inclusive and accountable communities.

THE NORTHWEST NETWORK, (December 10, 2013) <http://nwnetwork.org/who-we-are/>.

⁵⁷ THE NORTHWEST NETWORK, (December 10, 2013), <http://nwnetwork.org/>.

⁵⁸ *Id.*

⁵⁹ *Id.*

⁶⁰ *Id.*

allowing those individuals affected to be more discrete in seeking help. The website is available both on computers and by smart phone.⁶¹ One final feature worth noting is the section on Safer Surfing. If a user clicks on the Safer Surfing button, it redirects the user to a webpage dedicated to safe browsing and step-by-step instructions on how to delete internet history from a computer's web browser, which can be extremely important if someone's abuser is monitoring their web use.⁶²

B. Show Me Love

Show Me Love is a program similar to the Northwest Network that is run out of Washington, DC. Show Me Love! is a campaign that seeks to provide information to all people affected by intimate partner violence in LGBTQ communities.⁶³ The program was created by a grant from the Office of Victims of Crime and the Office of Justice Programs, under the U.S. Department of Justice.⁶⁴

Show Me Love is similar to The Northwest Network in that it combines many resources in one platform that is easy for members of the public and specifically residents of the Washington, DC area to use; however, it also focuses on legal services that are available to assist LGBTQ domestic violence victims. On its webpage "Know Your Rights," Show Me Love has five categories of rights with additional information for visitors to read about. These sections include: Protection From Abuse in Civil Court, Criminal Charges, Housing and Employment Rights, Rights Regarding Children, and Immigration Rights.⁶⁵ Most ley people do not fully understand the extent of the protections available, so this is a great way to educate them about the many options that may exist.

Another great tool that Show Me Love has is a 'Get Help' section. Within the 'Get Help' section, resources are organized into two options, Washington, DC or national.⁶⁶ Within each category there are nine broad categories of services. These areas include: Advocacy, Counseling, Emergency, Housing, Legal, LGBTQ-Specific, Medical, Spanish-Speaking, and Teen Specific.⁶⁷ Within each category there is a variety of more specific resources, depending on what the user is looking for.

Show Me Love, has other great information on the website including general information about LGBTQ domestic violence, a test to see if you

⁶¹ *Id.*

⁶² *Id.*

⁶³ SHOW ME LOVE, (December 10, 2013) <http://showmelovedc.org/>.

⁶⁴ *Id.*

⁶⁵ *Id.*

⁶⁶ *Id.*

⁶⁷ *Id.*

should be worried about your specific relationship, a postcard project which uses postcards to represent what a healthy relationship means to each artist, and general information about the campaign as well as contact information.⁶⁸ One final feature that is worth noting is the “quick escape” feature that is located at the top right of every page. If a user hits the “Leave this site quickly” button, it redirects the internet browser to Google.⁶⁹

VII. LGBTQ Safety Plans

Some communities and organizations have created LGBTQ domestic violence safety plans. These safety plans not only include the usual information from safety planning, like how to obtain safety and shelter and who to call in an emergency, but also contains additional information relating to LGBTQ concerns. The Lesbian, Gay & Bisexual Youth Plan from the Norfolk County District Attorney’s Office separated resources for young people into three separate sections: at school, at home, and on the street.⁷⁰ The brochure also contained information relating to the Massachusetts statute regarding discrimination against lesbian, gay, and bisexual people, which shows the legal standard that Massachusetts citizens can expect in their own state.⁷¹ In addition, the pamphlet also contained many phone numbers, besides 911, for (at-risk) youth to call.⁷² Some of the resources were LGBTQ specific, and other resources were general community resources that could provide help to LGBTQ intimate partner victims.⁷³

The Texas Association Against Sexual Assault also has a specific safety plan for LGBTQ Survivors of Sexual Assault.⁷⁴ The pamphlet contains some national resources, and then contains general information about “What to Do if You are Sexually Assaulted,” “What is sexual assault,” and a section about “Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual Transgender, Queer and Intersex Survivors of Sexual Assault.”⁷⁵ While the pamphlet does not have as many local or state resources, it does a great job summarizing generally what sexual assault is and some of the concerns that are directly

⁶⁸ *Id.*

⁶⁹ *Id.*

⁷⁰ NORFOLK COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY’S OFFICE, LEAFLET, LESBIAN, GAY & BISEXUAL YOUTH SAFETY PLAN (1991).

⁷¹ *Id.*

⁷² *Id.*

⁷³ *Id.*

⁷⁴ TEXAS ASSOCIATION AGAINST SEXUAL ASSAULT, LEAFLET, LGBTQI SURVIVORS OF SEXUAL ASSAULT.

⁷⁵ *Id.*

applicable to the LGBTQ community. For example, the pamphlet talks about homophobia, transphobia, and specifically what it is like to be a transgender survivor.⁷⁶ By including this specific information, the pamphlet is accessible and relatable to the entire LGBTQ community. Ideally, a mixture of information, such as the content available in the Suffolk County District Attorney's Office pamphlet and the narratives about LGBTQ survivor issues in the Texas Association's Against Sexual Assault would be an ideal combination to reach the greatest amount of victims and survivors, while providing the best resources available.

VIII. How Technology Can Improve LGBTQ Safety Plans

Technology and innovative ideas can help create more covert and hidden LGBTQ Domestic Violence Safety Plans that are safer for LGBTQ Domestic Violence victims to use. For example, when an LGBTQ Domestic Violence victim carries around papers, flyers, and other resources relating to domestic violence, the abuser may recognize that he or she may lose their partner. Additionally, the most dangerous time for a domestic abuse victim is right after they choose to leave their abusive partner.⁷⁷ At this point, the abuser may be so enraged he or she will do anything to make sure that the victim does not leave him or her.

With the development of mobile technologies the providers of domestic violence services have a unique opportunity to give resources to victims. Instead of carrying around paper safety plans, pamphlets, and other things that can easily be found, the victim has the opportunity to have all of the information available electronically. However, this presents an obstacle for a victim whose abuser is technologically savvy. If the abuser is technologically savvy, they may be able to track what sites the victim visits, which poses a higher risk for the victim. When using online resources, it is imperative that the victim knows how to clear his or her history in order to keep him or herself safer to ensure a higher level of safety.

With that being said, it was extremely difficult to find all of the resources for LGBTQ domestic violence resources. An 'application' for a phone or a website that does not show the history on the phone or computer would be a win-win solution to this issue. These types of services combine the resources victims need, along with keeping the resources discrete enough to keep the victim safe. Currently, this type of

⁷⁶ *Id.*

⁷⁷ Dr. John Schufeldt, M.D., St. Joseph's Hospital and Medical Center, Address at Domestic Violence & the Law, at the Sandra Day O'Connor College of Law, Arizona State University (Spring 2013).

resource is not available for LGBTQ Intimate Partner violence victims in Phoenix.

Another innovative idea to combat domestic violence was offered by Dr. Schufeldt, an emergency room physician, during a class presentation at the Sandra Day O'Connor College of Law. Dr. Schufeldt cited one hospital that was currently creating domestic violence information packets that could be inserted into a victim's sock while the abuser was not around at the hospital in order to keep the information discrete.⁷⁸ Innovative ideas that combine technology that is not able to be tracked are crucial for domestic violence victims in the future.

IX. Solutions for Phoenix

In order to help solve the LGBTQ Intimate Partner Violence problem in Phoenix, more streamlined services are needed. After all of the calling to various agencies and nonprofit organizations, no particular organization could offer an exhaustive list of resources for LGBTQ Domestic Violence victims. In order to solve this problem one group, whether it's (a) public agency or nonprofit organization needs to take the lead on performing a complete community audit of all the resources available and streamlining that list into one single document that can be distributed throughout the city of Phoenix. Without one exhaustive list of LGBTQ resources, domestic violence victims will not have the time or where-with-all to travel to all of the various agencies to get the help they deserve and desperately need. Because Phoenix does not have an LGBTQ Family Resource Center that covers domestic violence issues at this point, it is absolutely imperative that these resources are available online. While not everyone has access to the web, domestic violence victims most likely would have an easier time tracking down resources that are online, rather than traveling to each and every location of the individualized services. If the resources could also be organized into a phone application, it would be even better.

The Domestic Violence hotline needs a larger, more encompassing database for LGBTQ Domestic Violence victims. According to the Domestic Violence hotline there is one LGBTQ Domestic Violence resource in all of the Phoenix area. However, this not represent the full extent of the resources available. There are many nonprofit organizations in the Phoenix area that provide a number of resources to LGBTQ people. These nonprofit organizations and government agencies may not specifically provide resources to "Domestic Violence Victims/Survivors", but some provide food while others provide housing, clothes, etc. By

⁷⁸ *Id.*

taking a full audit of the resources in Phoenix and streamlining this information, it may be easier to separate the services by what specifically the LGBTQ Domestic Violence victim is searching for. Re-organizing the database and resources specifically by what the survivor is looking for would cast a wider net of possible resources and begin to piece together a cohesive list of resources that meets all the needs of LGBTQ domestic violence victims.

Of course, the best option for the city of Phoenix would be a family resource center. This would create a centralized location of resources that LGBTQ Domestic Violence victims could utilize. This venture could be privately and publicly funded since all parties have an economic interest in lowering and preventing the cost of domestic violence.⁷⁹ Given the large geographic area the city of Phoenix and surrounding communities encompass, one location would be a huge time saver for those parties who are interested in receiving help. Additionally, the center could offer proactive resources like the Northwest Network does, including classes and peer counseling to try and prevent the issues before they even occur.

In Phoenix we must not also forget about LGBTQ intimate partner violence batterers. LGBTQ Intimate Partner violence is based on a pattern of coercive control.⁸⁰ Batterer Intervention Programs have been designed to stop the coercive control and mediate the offender back to a healthy way of living.⁸¹ Batterer Intervention Programs have been proven successful to lower the rate of violence with offenders in long-term studies that were conducted six months after the treatment has ceased.⁸² There are programs around the country that have specific Batterer Intervention Programs designed to address concerns and needs that domestic violence batterers have as well as issues specific to the LGBTQ community.

In Massachusetts, the Department of Public Health created specific guidelines, which require batterer intervention programs to meet a number of criteria.⁸³ The program has educational components that required each batterer intervention program to educate their participants about general guidelines provided by the Massachusetts Guidelines and Standards for the Certification of Batterer Intervention Programs as well as specialized

⁷⁹ GWINN & STRACK, *supra* note 21, at 53-57.

⁸⁰ THE COMMONWEALTH OF MASSACHUSETTS, EXECUTIVE OFFICE OF HEALTH AND HUMAN SERVICES, DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC HEALTH, LEAFLET, PILOT PROGRAM SPECIFICATIONS FOR INTERVENTION WITH GAY, LESBIAN, BISEXUAL AND TRANSGENDER PERPETRATORS OF INTIMATE PARTNER VIOLENCE (1999).

⁸¹ *Id.*

⁸² Edward W. Gondolf, *Batterer Programs: What We Know and Need to Know*, 12 J. INTERPERSONAL VIOLENCE 1, 83-98 (1997).

⁸³ *See id.*

components.⁸⁴ The specific educational components that related to the LGBTQ community were: homophobia and internalized homophobia, HIV and sexual health, negative self-talk, relationship history, goal-setting, and role plays.⁸⁵ By addressing specific issues relating to the LGBTQ community, the batterer intervention program has a better chance of contributing to the success of the participants who enter the program.⁸⁶

Overall, in order to solve the LGBTQ intimate partner issue in Phoenix, the interested parties have to begin considering resources on a wider scale, since the area currently does not have many resources for that victim population.

X. Funding LGBTQ Intimate Partner Violence Resources in Phoenix

When considering starting a community resource or any type of program to help solve social issues in the community, inevitably the problem of funding comes up. Funding not only affects the quality of services given but whether or not specific services can be offered to the community. LGBTQ Domestic Violence Resource Centers are a great investment for the city of Phoenix and can be funded in a variety of ways. Due to the amount of money the city would be saving in the long-run by creating preventive programs that directly address these issues, all of the community agencies that have a stake in domestic violence should be interested in investing money upfront for services, instead of being reactionary and paying for trials and jail time in response to intimate partner violence.

The two model programs, The Northwest Network and Show Me Love, are funded in two separate ways. The Northwest Network is a 501(c)(3) nonprofit organization that accepts donations from the community as well as local businesses in the Seattle, Washington area.⁸⁷ Show Me Love is primarily funded by a grant that was received through the Department of Justice but is also funded through other grants and local businesses.⁸⁸ These models of funding show the importance of community based responsibility and funding of programs that affect multiple sectors of the community and a variety of agencies. By having multiple funding sources, the Family Justice Center or a similar program is not reliant on only one form of funding and is better able to meet the needs of the community by diversified funding.

⁸⁴ *Id.*

⁸⁵ *Id.*

⁸⁶ *Id.*

⁸⁷ *Supra* note 57.

⁸⁸ *Supra* note 63.

Casey Gwinn in San Diego has mastered the process of having community partners by involving city agencies from the city of San Diego, along with private foundations and local nonprofit organizations.⁸⁹ The impressive list of partnering organizations from the San Diego Family Justice Center includes thirty-three organizations, ranging from a local law school to the local military base, a hospital, and specific agencies within the city of San Diego.⁹⁰ By including a variety of organizations, family justice centers and new initiatives will make themselves more sustainable by ensuring that their funding is coming from a variety of services.

Conclusion

Overall, the community of Phoenix and surrounding communities need to think of new ways to cut the number of incidents concerning LGBTQ Domestic Violence. By working together and thinking of all the collaborative resources, nonprofit organizations,⁹¹ and government agencies can work together to create a list of comprehensive resources that are available for LGBTQ Domestic Violence victims. Additionally, with an exhaustive list of the resources available in the community, the areas of opportunity would be clearer and individual agencies could begin to fill those gaps.

⁸⁹ See GWINN & STRACK, *supra* note 21.

⁹⁰ *Id.* The list of partnering agencies include: Action Network-Human Trafficking Coalition, Adult Protective Services, Cal Western Law School-Legal Internship Program, Camp HOPE, Center for Community Solutions-HOPE Team (Elder Abuse), Children's Hospital-Chadwick Center Family Violence Project, Dress for Success, FJC Legal Network, Military (Navy & Marine Corps), San Diego City Attorney's Office-Child Abuse & Domestic Violence Unit, San Diego Deaf Mental Health Services, San Diego District Attorney's Office-Family Protection Division, Victim Assistance Program, San Diego Domestic Violence Council, San Diego County-Child Welfare Services, San Diego Family Justice Center Foundation, Family Justice Center Volunteer Program, San Diego FJC Chaplain's Program, San Diego Police Department-Domestic Violence Unit, San Diego Probation Department, San Diego Volunteer Lawyer Program-Family Law and Immigration Legal Services, San Diego State University (Stalking Assessment Project), The Crime Victims Fund, Sharp Grossmont Hospital, Soul Care Project, Speak for Success-Women's Leadership Institute, UCSD-Forensic Medical Unit, Teen Court Juvenile Diversion Program, The Rainforest Art Project, Travelers Aid, Union Pan Asian Communities (UPAC), Woman Infants and Children (WIC), YWCA of San Diego County.

⁹¹ Thank you to all of the various agencies who took time to list all of their resources. Everyone I worked with was extremely professional, helpful, and more than willing to give their time to help.